#### AIHA: ACCELERATING ADVANCEMENTS IN OUR SCIENCE, PRACTICE, AND STANDARDS OF CARE

YUMA Pacific – Southwest Section 48th Annual Meeting: "Scientific Accountability-Challenging Scientific Status Quo" January 20, 2023



#### **HEALTHIER WORKPLACES**

A HEALTHIER WORLD

#### JOHN MULHAUSEN, PhD, FAIHA

jrmulhausen@gmail.com



**Registered Specialist** Exposure Decision Analysis

AIHA Registry Programs®



## AIHA: ACCELERATING ADVANCEMENTS IN OUR SCIENCE, PRACTICE, AND STANDARDS OF CARE

## Agenda:

- AIHA Improving OEHS Science and Practice Initiatives – Progress and Plans
- Challenging the Status Quo: Reflections on Facilitating Change
- Q and A





# AIHA IMPROVING OEHS SCIENCE AND PRACTICE INITIATIVES

#### A WORLD WHERE ALL WORKERS AND THEIR COMMUNITIES ARE HEALTHY AND SAFE





## ADVANCING OUR SCIENCE AND PRACTICE TO BETTER PROTECT WORKERS AND COMMUNITIES

## **Four Exciting Initiatives:**

Initiative	Purpose
AIHA – ACGIH Defining	Advance our science to improve the ability of practitioners to protect
the Science workers and communities.	
Standards of Care	Define minimum practice performance expectations for ensuring acceptable worker protection.
State of the Art vs. Practice	Implement a continuous improvement strategy to close gaps between current practice and the state of the art and minimum standards of care.
AIHA – ACGIH Improving Exposure Judgements	Accelerate adoption of the use of IH statistical and other tools to improve the accuracy of worker exposure assessments.



## ADVANCING OUR SCIENCE AND PRACTICE TO BETTER PROTECT WORKERS AND COMMUNITIES

## **Four Exciting Initiatives:**

Initiative	Purpose
AIHA – ACGIH Defining the Science	Advance our science to improve the ability of practitioners to protect workers and communities.
Standards of Care	Define minimum practice performance expectations for ensuring acceptable worker protection.
State of the Art vs. Practice	Implement a continuous improvement strategy to close gaps between current practice and the state of the art and minimum standards of care.
AIHA – ACGIH Improving Exposure Judgements	Accelerate adoption of the use of IH statistical and other tools to improve the accuracy of worker exposure assessments.



## AIHA - ACGIH INITIATIVE: DEFINING THE SCIENCE

#### Making Research Work for Practitioners to Improve Protection for Workers and Communities

- Identify research initiatives needed to advance the state of OEHS science to address gaps in effective and efficient practice.
- 2. Identify areas of practice that do not hold up to current OEHS scientific findings so that AIHA, ACGIH, and other stakeholders may improve practice through focused outreach, promotion, and training.



**Practice-To-Research-To-Practice™** 



## **AIHA - ACGIH DEFINING THE SCIENCE**

# **Research Agenda - Inaugural Edition\***

- Reflects the needs of AIHA and ACGIH members as well as the OEHS Profession.
- Intended to stimulate ideas among academic, government, and private researchers.
- AIHA and ACGIH will use to advocate for OEHS research.
- Follows the Research to Practice to Research (R2P2R) model.
- Based on ideas suggested through the DTS submission process.
- New versions will be issued as new ideas are submitted, reviewed, and prioritized.

#### **Practice-To-Research-To-Practice™**



\*Draft Currently Under Review by Volunteer Groups



## **PRACTICE TO RESEARCH:**

#### **RESEARCH REQUIRED TO ADDRESS BARRIERS TO PRACTICE DUE TO A LACK OF KNOWLEDGE**

- Improving Occupational Safety and Health Surveillance
- Quantifying the Health and Economic Burden of Occupational Disease
- Improving Exposure Surveillance
- Improving Exposure and Risk Assessments
- Improving Decision-Making Using Monitoring Data
  - Worker Self-Monitoring
  - Aerosol Mixtures
  - Bioaerosol Monitoring
  - Commercial availability of high-flow inhalable samplers
  - Define Appropriate Bayesian Priors





#### **PRACTICE TO RESEARCH:** RESEARCH REQUIRED TO ADDRESS BARRIERS TO PRACTICE DUE TO A LACK OF KNOWLEDGE

- Validating Controls
  - Techniques for Validating the Predictability of Control Options
  - Developing Ventilation Systems for Welding and Cutting
  - Validation of WELL Health-Safety Rating for Buildings
  - PPE and Respiratory Protection
  - Validating the Efficacy and Safety of New Infection Control Technologies
- Characterizing the Need for Well Trained OEHS Professionals
- Improving Decision-Making When Exposure Monitoring Data Are Not Available
  - Improve Qualitative Judgement Accuracy
  - Exposure Predictor Model Development
  - Exposure Model Validation
- Ensuring Effective Respiratory Protection for Bioaerosols During a Pandemic



#### Practice-To-Research-To-Practice™



## **RESEARCH TO PRACTICE:**

# THE DISSEMINATION OF NEW KNOWLEDGE WITH THE POTENTIAL TO IMPROVE INDUSTRIAL HYGIENE PRACTICE

- Routine Use of Statistical Tools
- Exposure Predictor Model Development
- Heat Stress Management
- Total Worker Health Inclusivity of Psychosocial Disorders and Mental Health





## ADVANCING OUR SCIENCE AND PRACTICE TO BETTER PROTECT WORKERS AND COMMUNITIES

## **Four Exciting Initiatives:**

Initiative	Purpose	
AIHA – ACGIH Defining	Advance our science to improve the ability of practitioners to protect	
the Science	workers and communities.	
Standards of Care	Define minimum practice performance expectations for ensuring	
	acceptable worker protection.	
State of the Art vs. Practice	Implement a continuous improvement strategy to close gaps between current practice and the state of the art and minimum standards of care.	
AIHA – ACGIH Improving Exposure Judgements	Accelerate adoption of the use of IH statistical and other tools to improve the accuracy of worker exposure assessments.	



## **STANDARDS OF CARE (SOC)**

#### Purpose

- Document vital OEHS professional practices that reliably and effectively protect workers and communities from unacceptable risks.
- Provide a common vision of effective risk management practices for all OEHS professionals.
- Elevate the performance of all OEHS programs by providing a set of uniform program and performance targets that can be used in continuous improvement activities.

#### Approach

- Organized by OEHS area of practice, or domain, and include "soft skills" (non-technical skills for OEHS practitioners).
- For each area of practice, the SOC AG works very closely with relevant subject matter experts from AIHA volunteer groups and other partners to document risk-critical SOC and best practices.

#### SOC Currently Under Development

#### Round 1:

 Noise and Hearing Conservation IN PROCESS

#### Round 2:

- Exposure Assessment COMPLETE!
- Respiratory Protection Program
- Control Banding
- Management

#### Public Web Page

#### **CAIHA** GUIDELINE FOUNDATION

## **SOC USES AND LIMITATIONS**

- Reasonable for all OEHS practitioners around the world.
- Targets for continuous improvement strategies to meet or exceed over time.
- Implementation speed will vary (depends on size of the gap, resources available, etc.).
- For use by single organization practitioners and by consultants advising multiple clients.
- Include best practice criteria to inspire continuous improvement efforts.
- Time-sensitive: based on practices documented at the time of publication.
- Not comprehensive or complete. No rigorous review was conducted of every guidance, standard, and regulation around the world.
- Not a consensus of AIHA or the profession.
- Not intended as legal expectations, "requirements of practice", or "standards".
- Not equivalent to "minimum acceptable practice" which is primarily driven by regulatory requirements.
- There may be alternate approaches more efficient and effective than those in the SOC.

\*\* This document does not define or establish a legal or community standard, nor is it intended to be used to create a presumption of a breach of a legal duty, or form the basis for civil liability\*\*



## SOC SUGGESTED IMPLEMENTATION STRATEGY



## **OCCUPATIONAL EXPOSURE ASSESSMENT SOC**

## Sections:

- Scope & Objectives
- Program Management
- Basic Characterization
- Occupational Exposure Limits
- Similar Exposure Groups (SEGs)
- Exposure Judgments
- Monitoring Practices
- Non-Recurring Operations

- Health Hazard Controls
- Medical Surveillance
- Communication & Training
- Reassessments
- Control Banding
- Performance Measurement
- Recordkeeping

#### GUIDELINE FOUNDATION

## **OCCUPATIONAL EXPOSURE ASSESSMENT SOC**

#### **KEY CONTENT:**

SOC Section	Selected Key Content	
Scope & Objectives	<ul> <li>Assess and control all chemical, physical and biological exposures for all workers across all workdays</li> </ul>	
Program	Written program	
Management	<ul> <li>Under direction of an industrial hygienist experienced and trained in exposure assessment</li> </ul>	
Basic	<ul> <li>Critical information for characterizing exposures is documented for the workplace</li> </ul>	
Characterization		
<b>Occupational</b> • Authoritative or internal OELs are used for exposure judgments		
Exposure Limits	<ul> <li>Regulatory OELs are used if lower than authoritative or internal OELs</li> </ul>	
SEGs	• The workforce is stratified into similar exposure groups (SEG).	
Exposure	<ul> <li>Exposure are acceptable if the 95<sup>th</sup> percentile is less than the OEL with 70%</li> </ul>	
Judgments confidence (95% confidence best practice)		
	<ul> <li>An AIHA Exposure Control Category (ECC) and certainty rating are selected for each air contaminant and noise SEG</li> </ul>	
	• The exposure profile for each SEG is judged acceptable or unacceptable 17	

## **OCCUPATIONAL EXPOSURE ASSESSMENT SOC**

#### **KEY CONTENT:**

SOC Section	Selected Key Content	
Monitoring Practices	<ul> <li>3+ baseline samples are collected for each SEG initially rated ECC of 2 or 3</li> <li>Baseline sample data are analyzed using statistics to update the exposure category and the certainty rating</li> <li>3+ additional baseline samples are collected for SEGs with updated ECC of 2 or 3 having low or medium certainty</li> </ul>	
Non-recurring Ops	<ul> <li>Non-recurring operations are anticipated, prospectively assessed, and controlled</li> </ul>	
Health Hazard Controls	<ul> <li>Initially, SEGs judged unacceptable (ECC = 4) are quickly controlled</li> <li>Enhanced permanent controls (higher on the hierarchy) are sought in a prioritized manner</li> </ul>	
Med. Surveillance	<ul> <li>Med. surveillance is provided to workers in ECC 3 and 4 where protocols are available</li> </ul>	
Com. & Training	<ul> <li>Findings and recommendations are reported in an effective and timely fashion</li> </ul>	
Reassessments	<ul> <li>Management of change procedures are established to provide notification of newly planned changes in the workplace, workforce, or environmental agents</li> </ul>	
Control Banding	I Banding • Control banding approaches are considered in the exposure assessment process	
Perf. Meas.	• Performance measures are identified, tracked, and communicated to stakeholders	
Recordkeeping	• Exposure assessment records are maintained indefinitely 18	

## ADVANCING OUR SCIENCE AND PRACTICE TO BETTER PROTECT WORKERS AND COMMUNITIES

## **Four Exciting Initiatives:**

Initiative	Purpose	
AIHA – ACGIH Defining	Advance our science to improve the ability of practitioners to protect	
the Science	workers and communities.	
Standards of Care	Define minimum practice performance expectations for ensuring	
Standards of Care	acceptable worker protection.	
State of the Art vs. Practice	Implement a continuous improvement strategy to close gaps between current practice and the state of the art and minimum standards of care.	
AIHA – ACGIH Improving Exposure Judgements	Accelerate adoption of the use of IH statistical and other tools to improve the accuracy of worker exposure assessments.	



#### CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT: STATE OF THE ART VS. PRACTICE

#### **2022-24 AIHA ENTERPRISE STRATEGIC PLAN**

Mission - Empowering and advancing those who apply scientific knowledge to protect all workers and their communities from occupational and environmental hazards Vision – A world where all workers and their communities are healthy and safe

Value Proposition - AIHA members are scientists and professionals who protect the health and safety of workers and communities by reducing risks and safeguarding operations to help organizations operate efficiently and without interruption.

AIHA will and inclus

engage with allied professional organizations to work towards achieving common goals.

and safety (OEHS) by increasing awareness disseminate cutting-edge educational, of the value of the profession and growing technical, and career enrichment the organization and profession.

**Integrity of Professional Practice** 

 Implement a continuous improvement strategy to identify and address gaps between current and state of the art (best in class) OEHS practice.

	1. Implement a continuous	1. As thought leaders, build			
	improvement strategy to identify	awareness of the OEHS profession			
	and address gaps between current	and the value of the professionals'			
	and state of the art (best in class)	impact on businesses and			
	OEHS practice.	communities to influence			
	2. Advance competency in specialty	stakeholders, the public, and			
	areas through laboratory	policymakers at all levels of			
s.	accreditation, proficiency	government.			
	programs., and registry programs.	2. Empower AIHA members and th			
	3. Develop recognized leading	public to contact their policymake			
	metrics and best practices for	in support of AIHA public policy			
	worker and community health and	positions and issues.			
	safety, including organizational				
	social responsibility.				

continuously improve, and advance the public, government, and

Advocacy

AIHA will influence the actions of

organizations to advance worker

and community health and safety.

**Integrity of Professional Practice** 

AIHA will identify, develop,

excellence in OEHS practices.

#### IDENTIFY AND ADDRESS GAPS BETWEEN CURRENT AND STATE OF THE ART (BEST IN CLASS) OEHS PRACTICE.

- 1. Determine state of the art / best practices (Standards of Care Initiative).
- 2. Survey practitioners regarding risk-critical practices.
  - Document current practices and how they differ from best practices
  - Identify existing barriers to achieving best practice performance
- 3. Define and implement plans to address barriers and empower practitioners to close practice gaps and achieve best-in-class performance.

	Pilot Survey of Practitioners in 2023	
Learn More <u>Here</u>	Occupational Exposure Assessment	
	<ul> <li>Noise and Hearing Conservation</li> </ul>	



### ADVANCING OUR SCIENCE AND PRACTICE TO BETTER PROTECT WORKERS AND COMMUNITIES

## **Four Exciting Initiatives:**

Initiative	Purpose
AIHA – ACGIH Defining	Advance our science to improve the ability of practitioners to protect
the Science	workers and communities.
Standards of Care	Define minimum practice performance expectations for ensuring acceptable worker protection.
State of the Art vs. Practice	Implement a continuous improvement strategy to close gaps between current practice and the state of the art and minimum standards of care.
AIHA – ACGIH Improving Exposure Judgements	Accelerate adoption of the use of IH statistical and other tools to improve the accuracy of worker exposure assessments.



#### AIHA / ACGIH INITIATIVE: IMPROVING EXPOSURE JUDGEMENT ACCURACY

#### **Improve Practice to Align with Current Science**

Drive a significant shift in the OEHS practice paradigm: from one where tools and activities to improve exposure judgment accuracy and interpretation are rarely or sporadically used, to one where their use is routine and expected.

Public Web Page



This Photo licensed under <u>CC B</u> http://audiencestack.com/



# IMPROVING EXPOSURE JUDGEMENT ACCURACY WHY IMPORTANT?

# What if Our Exposure Assessment is Wrong?

#### If We Underestimate the Exposure?

Increased Risk to Employees

## If We Overestimate the Exposure?

- Unnecessary Constraints for Employees and Production
- Unnecessary Expenditures for Controls

#### Well-Designed Exposure Risk Management Strategy

We Want:	We Don't Want:	
Good Data	Bad Data	
To Be Effective	To Not Be Protective	
To Be Efficient	To Waste Resources	
No Biases	Biases (High or Low)	
Low Uncertainty	High Uncertainty	
<b>Correct Decisions</b>	Wrong Decisions	



# Exposure Risk Decisions: How Accurate Are We?



# With Monitoring Data . . .

Exposure Rating Category**	Recommended Control
<b>0</b> (<1% of OEL)	No action
<b>1</b> (<10% of OEL)	Procedures and Training; General Hazard Communication
<b>2</b> (10-50% of OEL)	+ Chemical Specific Hazard Communication; Periodic Exposure Monitoring,
<b>3</b> (50-100% of OEL)	+ Required Exposure Monitoring, Workplace Inspections to Verify Work Practice Controls; Medical Surveillance, Biological Monitoring
<b>4</b> (>100% of OEL)	+ Implement Hierarchy of Controls; Monitoring to Validate Respirator Protection Factor Selection.
Multiples of OEL (>500% of OEL or others based on respirator APF)	+Immediate Engineering Controls or Process Shut Down, Validate Acceptable Respirators

\*\* Decision statistic = 95<sup>th</sup> percentile

# Monitoring-Based Exposure Judgments

- Bad News
  - Often incorrect
  - Biased Low
- Good News
  - Simple statistical training improves judgments

\* P. Logan, G. Ramachandran, J. Mulhausen and P. Hewett "Occupational Exposure Decisions: Can Limited Data Interpretation Training Help Improve Accuracy?". Annals of Occupational Hygiene - 2009

\*\*Vadali, Ramachandran, Mulhausen & Banerjee (2012): "Effect of Training on Exposure Judgment Accuracy of Industrial Hygienists", Journal of Occupational and Environmental Hygiene, 9:4, 242-256

#### Before Statistical Training: Poor Accuracy & Underestimation Bias



# Monitoring-Based Exposure Judgments

- Bad News
  - Often incorrect
  - Biased low
- Good News
  - Simple statistical training improves judgments
- GREAT NEWS!!!
  - Using the FREE statistical tools when we make monitoring-based exposure judgments will greatly improve accuracy



# Statistical Approaches to Understanding the Exposure Profile



# **Statistical Approaches to Understanding the Exposure Profile**

#### Ethanol OEL = 1000 ppmMonitoring **Results:** 215 ppm 52 ppm 395 ppm 700 ppm 75 ppm

# **Bayesian Decision Analysis (BDA)**







# Easier to Interpret! Easier to communicate!

- BDA output gives probabilities easier for people to understand than traditional confidence intervals
- The uncertainty associated with small data sets shows up clearly so risk can be better communicated



# Advantages of Bayesian Statistics

- More Intuitive Depiction of Exposures and Uncertainty than Traditional Statistics
- Direct Alignment with AIHA Exposure Rating and Control Categories
- Easy to Communicate
- Great for small monitoring data sets . . . Including n=1
- Elegant Handling of Censored Data (Non-Detects) . . . Including Fully Censored Data

#### Sample Size n=1





# Exposure Risk Decisions: How Accurate Are We?



# Exposure Judgments Without Monitoring Data

- Bad News
  - Often incorrect
  - Biased low

\* P. Logan, G. Ramachandran, J. Mulhausen and P. Hewett "Occupational Exposure Decisions: Can Limited Data Interpretation Training Help Improve Accuracy?". Annals of Occupational Hygiene - 2009

\*\*Vadali, Ramachandran, Mulhausen & Banerjee (2012): "Effect of Training on Exposure Judgment Accuracy of Industrial Hygienists", Journal of Occupational and Environmental Hygiene, 9:4, 242-256

#### **Poor Accuracy & Underestimation Bias**



# Exposure Judgments Without Monitoring Data

- Bad News
  - Often incorrect
  - Biased low

## Good News

• Use of systematic approach improves accuracy

\* Susan F. Arnold; Mark Stenzel; Daniel Drolet; Gurumurthy Ramachandran; "Using Checklists and Algorithms to Improve Qualitative Exposure Judgment Accuracy", *Journal of Occupational and Environmental Hygiene* 2016, 13, 159-168.

## Checklist Tool Training and Use Improved Accuracy\*

	70%	Practicing OSH Professionals		
	60%	Pre-training	Accuracy Doubled	
	50%	accuracy not significantly	with Checklist Training and Use	
curacy	40%	different from random chance.	Baseline n = 61	
t Acc	30%		Checklist n = 115	
Percen	20%		Random chance	
	10%			
	0%			
	ې ب	inus? ninus? ninus? accur	a. plust plust plus?	
# Exposure Judgments Without Monitoring Data

- Bad News
  - Often incorrect
  - Biased low
- Good News
  - Use of systematic approach improves accuracy

### • GREAT NEWS!!!

- Improvements provided by systematic approach predicted by cognitive psychology decision-making research
- We can use those techniques!

# Learn From Our Colleagues in Cognitive Psychology . . .



# Making Decisions: Thinking Fast and Slow

### **Fast Thinking**

- Reflexive, quick, emotion-driven and instinctive.
- Good for the many routine decisions that we make every day.
- Reliance on emotion and individual experiences can lead to biases and faulty decision making.

### **Slow Thinking**

- Deliberate and logical.
- Requires energy and conscious focus.
- Serves us well when we have important decisions to make.



### **Driving Slow Thinking and Expertise:**

Setting Ourselves Up to Make Accurate Exposure Risk Decisions

Learning from our friends in psychology . . .

## **Use a Structured Approach**

- Systematic and transparent processes
- Clear decision rules
- Break judgments into component parts
- Questions and data in a logical order
- Document facts and assumptions
- Discuss with colleagues
- Document decision
- Provide reasons for the decision
- Focused training, coaching, and practice
- Accurate feedback mechanisms



# FREE RESOURCES

# **Free IH Statistical Analysis Tools**

### Traditional Statistics

• AIHA IHSTAT<sup>©</sup> - Excel application that calculates various exposure statistics, performs goodness of fit tests, and graphs exposure data.

### Bayesian Statistics

- **IHDA-AIHA** Stand-alone application for the analysis and interpretation of exposure monitoring datasets using traditional and Bayesian statistics.
- **Expostats** -Toolbox of web applications for the interpretation of IH measurements using Bayesian statistics.
- **IHSTAT-Bayes** Excel-based application that calculates various exposure statistics using a Bayesian model.

### All available from AIHA: <u>HERE</u>





# Free AIHA Exposure Assessment Tools

- IH/OEHS Exposure Scenario Tool (IHEST) Excel tool to aid Basic Characterization (BC)
- IHSkinPerm<sup>©</sup>

Excel tool for estimating dermal absorption.

- Basic Exposure Assessment (EA) and Sampling Spreadsheet Excel template for entering EA/BC and sampling data.
- Toxico-kinetic Extended Shift OEL Adjustment Excel tool for adjusting OELs using the Hickey and Reist approach.
- Structured Deterministic Model 2.0 (Formerly "Checklist Tool") Excel tool for estimating potential airborne exposures.
- IHMOD 2.0<sup>©</sup> Excel-based mathematical modeling spreadsheet





# FREE RESOURCES TRAINING

### **FREE WEBINAR ON STATISTICAL ANALYSIS TOOLS**

# **Making Accurate Exposure Risk Decisions**

Paul Hewett Ph.D, MS, CIH, FAIHA

Taught by Leading Experts





statistical analysis of monitoring data Jérôme Lavoué Ph.D., MS

Developed IH Data Analyst (IHDA) for Bayesian

Led the development of Expostats for Bayesian statistical analysis of monitoring data

John Mulhausen Ph.D., MS, CIH, CSP, FAIHA Authored the initial version of IHSTAT<sup>®</sup> for traditional statistical analysis of monitoring data



Andrew D. Perkins MS, CIH, CSP, COHC Experienced in the application of statistical tools in accordance with the AIHA Exposure Assessment Strategy

FR

Hours !

https://www.aiha.org/education/elearning/online-courses/making-accurate-exposure-risk-decisions

### **FREE WEBINAR ON STATISTICAL ANALYSIS TOOLS**

### 2022 Participant Feedback: 54% Response Rate (257/480)

"Statistics made simple – this should be a prerequisite for all industrial hygienists!"



"With this course, the light bulb went off. I have never liked/used statistics until I took this course."

6

0

100

No

Yes

Would you

recommend

this course?

"The course takes us (IHs) to the next level. It's where we should be at in our practice."

"A great overview of IH data analysis- a must for anyone charged with the interpretation of sampling results!"

"One of the easiest-to-understand offerings on this subject; ideal for individuals with little background or natural aptitude for the concepts."

"Great course. Every IH professional needs to take this course. This rubric should become part of the CIH exam." 251

300

200

# FREE RESOURCES COMPETENCY ASSESSMENT

### Exposure Decision Analysis: Competency Assessment

#### **Exposure Decision Criteria**

- Allowable Exceedance
- Needed Confidence
- Use of Exposure Categories

#### **Traditional Industrial Hygiene Stats**

- Properties of a lognormal distribution
- Upper percentile estimate calculation & interpretation
- Tolerance Limit calculation & interpretation

#### **Bayesian Decision Analysis (BDA)**

- Properties of a lognormal distribution
- Upper percentile estimate calculation & interpretation
- Tolerance Limit calculation & interpretation

#### Data and Similar Exposure Groups (SEGs)

- Rules for combining data
- Indications that a SEG may need refining

#### Learn More Here



#### **Registered Specialist** Exposure Decision Analysis

Demonstrate Competency and

Performance

AIHA Registry Programs®

#### **Decision Heuristics and Human Biases**

- Common sources of bias in data interpretation and exposure assessment
- How to avoid bias in data interpretation

#### **Exposure Data Interpretation**

- Most likely exposure category given data
- Meet the certainty requirement given data

# Techniques for Improving Professional Judgments

- Feedback loops (quantitative judgment > monitoring > qualitative judgment)
- Group judgment sessions
- Documentation of rationale
- Break decisions into aggregate parts (Modeling)

### **IMPROVING EXPOSURE DECISION ACCURACY: COMPLETE RESOURCE PACKAGE**



# FREE RESOURCES ANYONE CAN ACCESS

# **Accessing the Free Tools and Training Materials**



# **Free Tools and Training Materials**

### **Improving Exposure Judgments: An Introduction to IH Statistics**





### What's Included:

- Free Powerful and Easy-To-Use Statistical Tools.
  - Access tools: click here.
- Free Stand-Alone Online Webinar.
  - <u>Access webinar</u>
  - Access topical outline of webinar
- Free Online Independent Validation of Competency and Performance via the AIHA Exposure Decision Analysis Registry Exam.
  - **Exposure Decision Analysis Registry Program Information Pamphlet**
  - <u>Access Registry</u>
- Free Training Materials for Use by Anyone Conducting Virtual or In-Person Training.
  - "<u>Making Accurate Exposure Risk Decisions</u>" webinar slides and resources
  - "Improving IH Exposure Judgments: Train-the-Trainer" PDC slides & resources
- Four Roadmaps on How to Use the Free Materials

Free Tools and Training Materials Improving Exposure Judgments: An Introduction to IH Statistics

### Four Roadmaps on How to Use the Free Materials



Roadmap #1: Self-study using the standalone online training and assessment

<u>https://www.aiha.org/public-</u> <u>resources/aiha-academic-</u> <u>portal/roadmap-1-self-study-using-the-</u> <u>standalone-online-training-and-</u> <u>assessment</u>



Roadmap #2: Instructor assigned independent study using the standalone online training and assessment

https://www.aiha.org/publicresources/aiha-academicportal/roadmap-2-instructor-assignedindependent-study



Roadmap #3: Integration of the materials into virtual or inperson classroom lecture programs

<u>https://www.aiha.org/public-</u> <u>resources/aiha-academic-portal/roadmap-</u> <u>3-integration-of-training-materials-and-</u> <u>assessment-into-virtual-or-in-person-</u> <u>lecture-programs</u> Roadmap #4: Hybrid approach that mixes selfstudy with focused inperson lecture programs

https://www.aiha.org/publicresources/aiha-academicportal/roadmap-3-mixed-online-andin-person-training-and-assessment

# **Free Tools and Training Materials**

### **Improving Exposure Judgments: An Introduction to IH Statistics**

### **ROADMAP #4: Mixed Online and In-Person Training and Assessment**

- 1. **Teachers** review the free training materials from the webinar and from the Train-the-Trainer PDC.
- 2. **Teachers** select appropriate materials that emphasize key points and reinforce critical learning objectives for incorporation into their limited focus lecture and discussion program.
- 3. **Teachers** create an assignment for learners to complete steps 4 through 7 by a certain due date.
- 4. Learners download (and install if necessary) software for performing statistical analysis of data.
- 5. Learners complete the free "Making Accurate Exposure Risk Decisions" Webinar.
- 6. Learners complete the free "Practice Exam" associated with the webinar.
- 7. For missed practice exam questions, **learners** review the correct exam answers along with the appropriate sections in the webinar and provided worked examples to reinforce correct learning.
- 8. Teachers conduct lecture program focused on reinforcing key learnings from the webinar.
- 9. Learners use successful completion of the free Exposure Decision Analysis Registry Exam as a demonstration of learning objective competency and proficiency.
- Teachers confirm demonstration of competency and proficiency via AIHA Registry list of Registered Specialists - Exposure Decision Analysis. Upon successful completion of the exam, learner's name will be featured on the AIHA Registry List of Registered Specialists: Exposure Decision Analysis.

# LEARN MORE

### Learn More:

#### Papers - Bayesian Analysis :

- Hewett, P., Logan, P., Mulhausen, J., Ramachandran, G., and Banerjee, S.: "Rating Exposure Control using Bayesian Decision Analysis", Journal of Occupational and Environmental Hygiene, 3: 568– 581, 2006
- Jérôme Lavoué, Lawrence Joseph, Peter Knott, Hugh Davies, France Labrèche, Frédéric Clerc, Gautier Mater, Tracy Kirkham, "Expostats: A Bayesian Toolkit to Aid the Interpretation of Occupational Exposure Measurements", Annals of Work Exposures and Health, Volume 63, Issue 3, April 2019, Pages 267–279

#### **Papers – Improving Exposure Decision Accuracy**

- Logan P., G. Ramachandran, J. Mulhausen, S. Banerjee, and P. Hewett "Desktop Study of Occupational Exposure Judgments: Do Education and Experience Influence Accuracy?" Journal of Occupational and Environmental Hygiene, 8:12, 746-758, 2011.
- Logan P., G. Ramachandran, J. Mulhausen, and P. Hewett:" Occupational Exposure Decisions: Can Limited Data Interpretation Training Help Improve Accuracy?" Annals of Occupational Hygiene, Vol. 53, No. 4, pp. 311–324, 2009.
- Vadali, M. G. Ramachandran, J. Mulhausen, S. Banerjee, "Effect of Training on Exposure Judgment Accuracy of Industrial Hygienists". Journal of Occupational & Environmental Hygiene. 9: 242–256, 2012.
- Arnold S., M. Stenzel, D. Drolet, G. Ramachandran; Journal of Occupational and Environmental Hygiene, 13, 159-168, 2016

### Learn More:

- Books:
  - A Strategy for Assessing and Managing Occupational Exposures. 4th Ed. AIHA Press. 2015.
- Opinion:
  - Mulhausen, J. "Faulty Judgment" President's Message. The Synergist. (November 2021). <u>Access HERE</u>
  - Mulhausen, J. "How to Improve Exposure Judgments" President's Message. The Synergist. (December 2021). <u>Access HERE</u>
  - Mulhausen, J. "Standards of Care: Competence PLUS Performance" President's Message. The Synergist. (January 2022). <u>Access HERE</u>
  - Mulhausen, J. "Acknowledging and Addressing Our Blind Spots" President's Message. The Synergist. (March 2022). <u>Access HERE</u>
  - Martin, K., Murphy, M. and Taruru S. "How "Professional" Is Professional Judgment?" Viewpoint. The Synergist. (December 2022). <u>Access HERE</u>
- Video Webinar:
  - Mulhausen, J. "Top 10 Imperatives for the AIHA Exposure Risk Management Process." Free from <u>AIHA HERE</u>

# CHALLENGING THE STATUS QUO REFLECTIONS ON FACILITATING CHANGE

**AIHA Initiative** 

**3M Program** 



AIHA Initiative		3M Program			
AIHA – ACGIH Defining the Science		P2R2P Partnerships to Advance Our Science: 3M <-> U of MN <-> AIHA <-> NIOSH			
Desktop Study of Occupational Exposure Judgments: Do Education and Experience Influence Accuracy?		Rating Expos	Exposure Control Using Bayesian Decision Analysis		
Perry W. Logan, <sup>1,2</sup> Gurumurthy Ramachandran, <sup>1</sup> John R. Mulhausen, <sup>1,2</sup> Sudipto Banerjee, <sup>3</sup> and Paul Hewett <sup>4</sup> <sup>1</sup> Division of Environmental Health Sciences, School of Public Health, University of Minnesota, Minneapolis, Minnesota <sup>2</sup> 3M Company, St. Paul, Minnesota <sup>3</sup> Division of Biostatistics, School of Public Health, University of Minnesota, Minneapolis, Minnesota <sup>4</sup> Exposure Assessment Solutions, Inc., Morgantown, West Virginia		Paul Hewett, <sup>1</sup> Perry Logan, <sup>2</sup> John Mulhausen, <sup>2</sup> Gurumurthy Ramachandran, <sup>3</sup> and Sudipto Banerjee <sup>3</sup> <sup>1</sup> Exposure Assessment Solutions, Inc., Morgantown, West Virginia <sup>2</sup> 3M, Minneapolis, Minnesota <sup>3</sup> University of Minnesota, Minneapolis, Minnesota			
Effect of Training on Exposure Judgment Accuracy of Industrial Hygienists Monika Vadali, <sup>1</sup> Gurumurthy Ramachandran, <sup>1</sup> John R Mulhausen, <sup>2</sup> and Sudipto Banerjee <sup>3</sup> Division of Environmental Health Sciences, School of Public Health, University of Minnesota, Monika Vadali, <sup>1</sup> Gurumu Division of Biostatistics, School of Public Health, University of Minnesota, Minneapolis, Minnesota Division of Biostatistics, School of Public Health, University of Minnesota, Minneapolis, Minnesota Division of Biostatistics, School of Public Health, University of Minnesota, Minneapolis, Minnesota Division of Biostatistics, School of Public Health, University of Minnesota, Minneapolis, Minnesota		A model is presente techniques to the problem number of exposure mea file for a similar exposure	Occupational Exposure Decisions: Can Limited Data Interpretation Training Help Improve Accuracy?		
		ling in Occup g urthy Ramachandra	PERRY LOGAN <sup>1</sup> , GURUMURTHY RAMACHANDRAN <sup>2</sup> *, JOHN MULHAUSEN <sup>1</sup> and PAUL HEWETT <sup>3</sup> <sup>1</sup> 3M, 900 Bush Avenue, St Paul, MN 55144, USA; <sup>2</sup> Division of Environmental Health Sciences, University of Minnesota, Minneapolis, MN 55455, USA; <sup>3</sup> Exposure Assessment Solutions, Morgantown, WV, USA		
		of Environmental Health Sc	Received 22 September 2008; in final form 19 January 2009 Accurate exposure assessments are critical for ensuring that potentially hazardous exposures are properly identified and controlled. The availability and accuracy of exposure assessments can determine whether resources are appropriately allocated to engineering and administra-		



AIHA Initiative	3M Program	
AIHA – ACGIH Defining the Science	P2R2P Partnerships to Advance O 3M <-> U of MN <-> AIHA <-> NIO	Safe Emp Evalu
Standards of Care	<b>Global Safety and Health Plan</b>	24-H Cher

#### **Global Safety and Health Plan (GSHP)**

- Worldwide Minimum Heath and Safety Program Requirements
- Foundational Standard of Care Wherever 3M Operates
- Annual Self Assessment
- Safety and Health Audits Performed Against the GSHP Requirements\*
   \*Including validation of facility's self-assessment scores

**Consistent Expectations for Improvement Manufacturing, Warehouse, Offices, R&D** 

# 

#### **GSHP Elements**

Location Safety and Health Plan Leadership Attributes Performance Appraisal Safety and Health Committee fing and Qualifications entation and Training -Surveys and Evaluations ty and Health Records lovee Involvement and Ownership uation and Control of Hazards Safety Leading Indicators lour Safety and Health mical Exposure Management Process Hazard Management Ergonomics **Emergency Preparedness** Incident Reporting and Follow-up **Contractor Safety and Health** Medical Surveillance Biosafetv Medical Records / Confidentiality Clinical Health Services Return to Work Hazard Communication Respirators **Electrical Safety Ionizing Radiation** Non-Ionizing Radiation Powered Industrial Vehicles **Fire Protection and Prevention** Vehicle Safety Lockout/Tagout Machine Guarding Noise Control & Hearing Conservation Hoist Systems Fall Protection **Confined Space Entry** Flammable Liquid Handling / Storage **Personal Protective Equipment** Ventilation for Contaminant Control

AIHA Initiative	3M Program		
AIUA ACCIU Defining the Science	P2R2P Partnerships to Advance Our Science:		
AIRA – ACGIR Defining the Science	3M <-> U of MN <-> AIHA <-> NIOSH		
Standards of Care	Global Safety and Health Plan		
State of the Art vs. Practice	EHS Management System		

#### **EHS Management System**

- Worldwide Facility / Division / Country EHS Planning Process
- Gap Analysis and Prioritization
- Annual Improvement Plan Development and Implementation
- Quarterly Scorecard Reporting

**Global Framework for Continuous Improvement in EHS Performance** 



This Photo by Unknown Author is licensed under CC BY-NC-ND



AIHA Initiative	3M Program		
AILLA ACCILL Defining the Science	P2R2P Partnerships to Advance Our Science:		
AIRA – ACGIR Denning the Science	3M <-> U of MN <-> AIHA <-> NIOSH		
Standards of Care	Global Safety and Health Plan		
State of the Art vs. Practice	EHS Management System		
AIHA – ACGIH Improving Exposure Judgements	Enterprise-Wide Exposure Assessment and Mgmt. System		

#### **Enterprise-Wide Exposure Assessment and Management System**

Consistent Global Process

- Standardized Risk Decision Criteria
- Reliable Calibration & Risk Prioritization
- Effective & Efficient Risk Management
- Accountability for Improvement

Sustainable Health and Safety: Process-Based, Not Champion-Based



### **Lessons Learned:**

- Change is Threatening
- WIIFM
- Find and Reduce the Barriers
- First Followers
- Continuous Improvement
- Calibration
- Catch 22
- 73 Times



This Photo by Unknown Author is licensed under <u>CC BY-SA-NC</u>



### **CHANGE IS THREATENING**

- Misunderstanding the Need for Change
- Disruptive
- Fear of the Unknown
- Fear of Failure
- Loss of Control
- More Time / Work
- New Process
- New Language



**Kubler-Ross Change Curve** 

Designed while at Deloitte Consulting

# WIIFM (WHAT'S IN IT FOR ME???)

# Why do you do what you do?How well do you want to do it?

#### **Benefits - As a Professional and as Part of Our Profession**

- Better Protect Workers
- Effective and Efficient Risk Management
- Science-Driven Programs to Deliver Shop-Floor Performance
- Improved Credibility
- We're in this Together Motivated and Energized!

A WORLD WHERE ALL WORKERS AND THEIR COMMUNITIES ARE HEALTHY AND SAFE





# WIIFM (WHAT'S IN IT FOR ME???)

### WIIFM Reminder: Industrial Hygiene is a Moral and a Scientific Endeavor

# IH Practice: A Combination of Technical and Ethical Decisions.

- Ethical Decisions:
  - -Whose risk and benefit?
  - -What types of risks and benefits?
- Technical Decisions:

AIHA

-Science to better protect workers must be implemented to be effective.

- Know that many current practices have high likelihood of systematic error . . .
- Know that error results in excess risk or cost . . .
- Know how to fix it . . .



This Photo by Unknown Author is licensed under <u>CC BY-NC</u>

66

## **FIND AND REDUCE THE BARRIERS**

# Ask, Listen, Learn, . . . Repeat!

**Develop and Implement** 

- Tools
- Training
- Templates
- Communication Tips and Techniques



# **IMPORTANCE OF FIRST FOLLOWERS**

### First Follower: Leadership Lessons from Dancing Guy

- It is NOT about the leader. It is about the community and the movement.
- It is the first followers that transform a lone nut into a leader.
- Follow and show others how to follow.

- Derek Sivers <u>https://sive.rs/ff</u>





# IMPORTANCE OF FIRST FOLLOWERS PARTNERS

### First Follower: Leadership Lessons from Dancing Guy

- It is NOT about the leader. It is about the community and the movement.
- It is the first followers that transform a lone nut into a leader.
- Follow and show others how to follow.

- Derek Sivers <u>https://sive.rs/ff</u>



We don't need a Dancing Guy. We need a Listening Guy. We need a Relational Gal. We need a Curious Guy. We need a person who says, "I've got an idea, but I hope you can make it better." We need good teachers who aren't out there only doing a highstepping solo. They're teaching others to dance — and how to dance together." - Larry Ferlazzo <u>The Problem with Dancing Guy</u>

# IMPORTANCE OF FIRST FOLLOWERS PARTNERS

# Please . . . Engage as a First Partner!

### Learn to dance, teach others to dance — and how to dance together!

- Earn the Exposure Decision Analysis Registered Specialist Designation
- Submit Science Improvement Needs to the DTS Portal
- Engage with Your Local OEHS Training Programs
- Engage Others in Your Organization
- Present at Your Local Section
- Write a Synergist Article
- Present at AIHce
- Develop a PDC

# YOUR NAME HERE



**Registered Specialist** Exposure Decision Analysis

AIHA Registry Programs®



### **COMMIT TO CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT VS. PERFECTION**

- Break Into Manageable Pieces
- Multiple Prioritization Steps
- Seek Quick Wins
- Phased-In Implementation
- Leverage Organization Strengths
- Anticipate Set-Backs Understand That Change is often Messy
- Build in Opportunities for Sharing, Learning and Discussion
- Celebrate Successes



This Photo by Unknown Author is licensed under CC BY-SA



### CALIBRATION

## Are our risk decisions consistent? Calibrated?



	Likelihood							
Severity	V. High	High	Medium	Low	V. Low			
V. High								
High								
Medium								
Low								
V. Low								




Impact Consequence Hazard Category Severity Catastrophic Critical Serious Moderate Negligible Minor Probability Likelihood Frequency

Frequent Probable Occasional Remote Improbable Almost Certain Likely Possible Seldom Unlikely Rare

Very High High Medium Low Very Low

# CALIBRATION

# Are our risk decisions consistent? Calibrated?

Employee performs a job 100 times per year. If you collected full-shift personal samples on the employee all 100 times, how many times is it acceptable for exposures to exceed the Occupational Exposure Limit (OEL) without a respirator?

39%	1. 0 samples		
7%	2. <mark>1 sa</mark> mple	How much assurance?	
35%	3. 5 samples		
17%	4. 10 samples	9% 1. 100% Sure 11% 2. 99% Sure	
2%	5. <mark>2</mark> 5 samples	74% 3. 95% Sure	
0% <b>46 Res</b> r	6. 50 samples	6% 4. 90% Sure	
		0% 5.75% Sure   0% 6.50% Sure 47 Response	S

#### **Driving Slow Thinking and Expertise:**

Setting Ourselves Up to Make Accurate Exposure Risk Decisions

Learning from our friends in psychology . . .

# **Use a Structured Approach**

- Systematic and transparent processes
- Clear decision rules
- Break judgments into component parts
- Questions and data in a logical order
- Document facts and assumptions
- Discuss with colleagues
- Document decision
- Provide reasons for the decision
- Focused training, coaching, and practice
- Accurate feedback mechanisms



#### **Driving Slow Thinking and Expertise:**

Setting Ourselves Up to Make Accurate Exposure Risk Decisions

Learning from our friends in psychology . . .

# **Use a Structured Approach**

- Systematic and transparent processes
- Clear decision rules
- Break judgments into component parts
- Questions and data in a logical order
- Document facts and assumptions
- Discuss with colleagues
- Document decision
- Provide reasons for the decision
- Focused training, coaching, and practice
- Accurate feedback mechanisms

# Calibration

Organization

Site

Profession

## CALIBRATION

#### **Processes and Programs Must Deliver Required Performance**

# **Example Unacceptable Operation: Exposures Exceed OEL** 25% of the Time. **OSHA Strategy AIHA Strategy**

#### **Strategy Performance**

"Acceptable" 75% of the time



95% confident that 95% ile less than OEL "Acceptable" <1% of the time



0 0.05 0.1 0.15 0.2 0.25 0.3 0.35 0.4 0.45 0.5 Individual Exceedance Fractio

Performance Curve

0 0.05 0.1 0.15 0.2 0.25 0.3 0.35 0.4 0.45 0. Individual Exceedance Fraction

Performance Curve

0.5

#### THE CATCH 22 OF ESTABLISHED PROFESSIONAL CULTURE

- Entrenched Procedures
- Training Programs
- Accreditation and Certification Requirements

#### **Complicates Implementation** of Needed Changes

- e.g.- Exposure Decision Quality Control
  - Occ. Exposure Banding (OEB)
  - Statistical Analysis of Monitoring Data



Repeat, Repeat, Repeat, Repeat, . . .

#### Marketing "Rule of 7" X 10 . . . plus a few more Compelling Message Repeated Often and in Different Ways

"If you're getting tired of delivering your message, then good for you. That means you're doing your job." - <u>David Grossman</u>



#### **Spreading the Word: Professionals and Professional Bodies**

- AIH Board: 2010
- ABIH Board: 2010
- Academic SIG: 2010
- Academic Advisory Committee: 2010 (ABET Requirements)
- PDC at NIOSH: 2008 and 2022
- IOHA Presentations: 2022
- Numerous PDCs & Presentations: 2000 to 2023 AIHce, PCIH, Local Sections, Korea, Singapore, UK, Brazil, So. Africa, India, Australia, Canada



#### **Spreading the Word: Professionals and Profes**

- AIH Board: 2010
- ABIH Board: 2010
- Academic SIG: 2010

AIHA

- Academic Advisory Committee: 2010 (ABET Requirements)
- PDC at NIOSH: 2008 and 2022
- IOHA Presentations: 2022
- Numerous PDCs & Presentations: 2000 to 2023 AIHce, PCIH, Local Sections, Korea, Singapore, UK, Brazil, So. Africa, India, Australia, Canada



#### 2015 Vision For Every Industrial Hygienist

- Use statistical tools every time we make exposure judgments based on monitoring.
- Participate in at least one activity every year to improve judgment accuracy.





#### **Spreading the Word: Professionals and Profes**

- AIH Board: 2010
- ABIH Board: 2010

- Academic SIG: 2010
- Academic Advisory Committee: 2010 (ABET Requirements)
- PDC at NIOSH: 2008 and 2022
- IOHA Presentations: 2022
- Numerous PDCs & Presentations: 2 AIHce, PCIH, Local Sections, Korea, Singa So. Africa, India, Australia, Canada

#### ABIH Lifetime Achievement Award Presentation John Mulhausen, Ph.D., CIH, CSP

**Our Ongoing Professional Challenge** 

ABIH Forum - Session B13 Monday, May 21st, **2018** 11:40 AM to 12:00 PM

Rooms 109A – B, Philadelphia Convention Center

#### **Our Ongoing Professional Challenge**

#### **Outline:**

- Back Then
- Since Then
- Still Needed!

#### 

<del>015 ·</del>Vision For Every Industrial Hygienist

- Use statistical tools every time we make exposure judgments based on monitoring.
- Participate in at least one activity every year to improve judgment accuracy.





Ph.D., CIH, CSP

Presentation 2009

Every nist

Running From the

**Dart-Throwing Monkeys** 

he we make d on monitoring. activity every accuracy.



#### **Spreading the Word: Professionals and Professionals**

Running From the Dart-Throwing Monkeys

-2-



#### AIHA – 2022 TO 2024 STRATEGIC PLAN

Initiative	Purpose	
AIHA – ACGIH Defining	A – ACGIH Defining Advance our science to improve the ability of practitioners to protect	
the Science	workers and communities.	
Standards of Care	Define minimum practice performance expectations for ensuring acceptable worker protection.	
State of the Art vs. Practice	Implement a continuous improvement strategy to close gaps between current practice and the state of the art and minimum standards of care.	
AIHA – ACGIH Improving Exposure Judgements	Accelerate adoption of the use of IH statistical and other tools to improve the accuracy of worker exposure assessments.	

A world where all workers and their communities are healthy and safe





AIHA

#### Brainstorming just a few opportunities . . .

- Tools Development
  - Proficiency Data Interpretation (PDI) Program ... Like PAT program
  - International Affairs Outreach to International practitioners and organizations
  - AIHA Committees: Mechanisms to improve Judgment Accuracy in various technical niches
- **Local** Training Programs
- Sections Facilitate "Decision Criteria" Discussion
- Promote expectation for accurate judgments and data interpretation as part of good science when using TLVs
- Lead role for coordinating efforts
  - ABET Accreditation Requirements
  - Specific ethics training
  - Core Competency Rigor



#### Brainstorming just a few opportunities . . .

- Ongoing judgment training requirements for CIH. . . ethics
- Re-write yellow book
  - Research

ABIH

NIOSH

**OSHA** 

- Tool development
- Put into practice with HHEs
- R2P  $\rightarrow$  Promote Solutions
- Training Programs Review during ERC grant application process
- Generic Exposure Assessment Standard
  - Incorporate into revised PEL regulation or legislation
  - Discussion point when reviewing company programs
  - VPP requirement
- Universities Incorporate into training programs Academic SIG

#### "It always seems impossible until it's done."

- Nelson Mandela



# THANK YOU



#### **HEALTHIER WORKPLACES**

#### JOHN MULHAUSEN, PH.D., FAIHA

jrmulhausen@gmail.com



**Registered Specialist** Exposure Decision Analysis

AIHA Registry Programs®

A HEALTHIER WORLD

